

Supplementary Materials

A decision-making model for echelon utilization of retired batteries in competitive duopoly: the role of government subsidy

Senlin Zhao, Mengxiang Wang, Chenhui Ma

School of Economics and Management, Shanghai Maritime University, Shanghai 201306, China.

Correspondence to: Assoc. Prof. Senlin Zhao, School of Economics and Management, Shanghai Maritime University, 1550 Haigang Ave, Shanghai 201306, China. E-mail: slzhao@shmtu.edu.cn

Proof of Proposition 1: We first calculate the second-order partial derivatives of π_1 and π_2 to p_1 and p_2 , respectively. Since $\frac{\partial^2 \pi_1}{\partial p_1^2} = \frac{\partial^2 \pi_2}{\partial p_2^2} = -2\beta < 0$, π_1 and π_2 are both concave functions of p_1 and p_2 . Let the first-order partial derivatives of π_1 and π_2 to p_1 and p_2 be zero, so we can get p_1^* and p_2^* and substitute them into π_r . Since $\frac{\partial^2 \pi_r}{\partial w^2} = \frac{4\beta(-\beta+\gamma)}{2\beta-\gamma}$ and Assumption 4, we know that $\frac{\partial^2 \pi_r}{\partial w^2} < 0$ and π_r is a concave function of w . Let the first-order partial derivative of π_r to w be zero, and we can get w^* and then substitute them into π_m . If we compute the second-order partial derivatives of π_m to P and F , respectively, then we can get the Hessian

matrix as
$$\begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial^2 \pi_m}{\partial P^2} & \frac{\partial^2 \pi_m}{\partial P \partial F} \\ \frac{\partial^2 \pi_m}{\partial F \partial P} & \frac{\partial^2 \pi_m}{\partial F^2} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -2b & 0 \\ 0 & \frac{2\beta(\gamma-\beta)}{2\beta-\gamma} \end{bmatrix}$$
. According to Assumption 4, we know that

the matrix is negative definite. Let the first-order partial derivatives of π_m to P and F be zero, then we can get P^* and F^* and substitute them into previous results. We get the final p_1^* , p_2^* , w^* , T_1^* , T_2^* , Q^* , G^* , π_m^* , π_r^* , π_1^* , π_2^* .

Proof of Corollary 1: Let the first-order partial derivatives of p_1^* and p_2^* to C_1 and C_2 , then we can get $\frac{\partial p_1^*}{\partial C_1} = \frac{\beta(10\beta-3\gamma)}{32\beta^2-8\gamma^2} \frac{\partial p_1^*}{\partial C_2} = \frac{\beta(-6\beta+5\gamma)}{32\beta^2-8\gamma^2} \frac{\partial p_2^*}{\partial C_1} = \frac{\beta(-6\beta+5\gamma)}{32\beta^2-8\gamma^2} \frac{\partial p_2^*}{\partial C_2} = \frac{\beta(10\beta-3\gamma)}{32\beta^2-8\gamma^2}$, which can be proven by discussing the positivity and negativity of four partial derivatives according to Assumption 4.

Given the first-order partial derivatives of w^* to C_1 and C_2 , respectively, then we can get $\frac{\partial w^*}{\partial C_1} = \frac{\partial w^*}{\partial C_2} = -\frac{1}{8}$.

Proof of Corollary 2: The four conclusions in Corollary 2 have similar proofs, so for simplicity, we prove only conclusion (1) here. Because $\frac{\partial^2 \pi_1^*}{\partial C_1^2} = \frac{\beta(-10\beta^2-3\beta\gamma+5\gamma^2)^2}{32(-4\beta^2+\gamma^2)^2} > 0$, the first-order partial derivative of π_1^* to C_1 is monotonically increasing. Let $\frac{\partial \pi_1^*}{\partial C_1} = 0$, then we can get $C_1 = \frac{1}{10\beta^2+3\beta\gamma-5\gamma^2} ((4\beta^2 - 2\beta\gamma - 2\gamma^2)C_0 + (6\beta^2 + 5\beta\gamma - 3\gamma^2)C_2 + 2(2\beta + \gamma)(e - h\beta + h\gamma + (\beta - \gamma)C_m + (-\beta + \gamma)C_r))$.

According to monotonicity, (1) can be proved.

Proof of Corollary 3: We can easily get the first-order partial derivative of $p_1^{s^*}$ to S as $\frac{\partial p_1^{s^*}}{\partial S} = \frac{\beta(-10\beta+3\gamma)}{32\beta^2-8\gamma^2}$. According to Assumption 4, it is easy to know that $4\beta^2 - \gamma^2 > 0$ and $3\gamma - 10\beta < 0$. From this, we can prove that $\frac{\partial p_1^{s^*}}{\partial S} < 0$ and show similarly that $\frac{\partial p_2^{s^*}}{\partial S} > 0$. We can easily get the first-order partial derivative of w^{s^*} to S as $\frac{\partial w^{s^*}}{\partial S} = \frac{1}{8} > 0$ and, thus, prove Corollary 3.

Proof of Corollary 4: The two conclusions in Corollary 4 are proved similarly, so we prove just (1) here. Because $\frac{\partial^2 \pi_1^{s^*}}{\partial S^2} = \frac{\beta(10\beta^2+3\beta\gamma-5\gamma^2)^2}{32(-4\beta^2+\gamma^2)^2} > 0$, the first-order partial

derivative of $\pi_1^{s^*}$ to S is monotonically increasing. Let $\frac{\partial \pi_1^{s^*}}{\partial S} = 0$, then we can get

$$S = \frac{1}{10\beta^2+3\beta\gamma-5\gamma^2} (-4e\beta + 4h\beta^2 - 2e\gamma - 2h\beta\gamma - 2h\gamma^2 + 2(-2\beta^2 + \beta\gamma + \gamma^2)C_0 + (10\beta^2 + 3\beta\gamma - 5\gamma^2)C_1 - 6\beta^2C_2 - 5\beta\gamma C_2 + 3\gamma^2C_2 - 4\beta^2C_m + 2\beta\gamma C_m + 2\gamma^2C_m + 4\beta^2C_r - 2\beta\gamma C_r - 2\gamma^2C_r).$$

(1) can, thus, be proved according to the principles of monotonicity.

Table 1. The profits of each member of the supply chain without subsidies

| |
|--|
| $T_1^* = \frac{1}{32\beta^2 - 8\gamma^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2 + (4\beta^2 - 2\beta\gamma - 2\gamma^2)C_0$ $+ (-10\beta^2 - 3\beta\gamma + 5\gamma^2)C_1 + 6\beta^2C_2 + 5\beta\gamma C_2 - 3\gamma^2C_2 + 4\beta^2C_m$ $- 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r + 2\gamma^2C_r$ |
| $T_2^* = \frac{1}{32\beta^2 - 8\gamma^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2 + (4\beta^2 - 2\beta\gamma - 2\gamma^2)C_0$ $+ (6\beta^2 + 5\beta\gamma - 3\gamma^2)C_1 - 10\beta^2C_2 - 3\beta\gamma C_2 + 5\gamma^2C_2 + 4\beta^2C_m$ $- 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r + 2\gamma^2C_r)$ |
| $\pi_m^* = \frac{1}{16b(\beta - \gamma)(2\beta - \gamma)} (4be^2\beta + 8a^2\beta^2 - 8beh\beta^2 + 4bh^2\beta^3 - 12a^2\beta\gamma$ $+ 8beh\beta\gamma - 8bh^2\beta^2\gamma + 4a^2\gamma^2 + 4bh^2\beta\gamma^2 + 4b\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_0^2$ $+ b\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_1^2 - 4be\beta^2C_2 + 4bh\beta^3C_2 + 4be\beta\gamma C_2 - 8bh\beta^2\gamma C_2$ $+ 4bh\beta\gamma^2C_2 + b\beta^3C_2^2 - 2b\beta^2\gamma C_2^2 + b\beta\gamma^2C_2^2 - 16ab\beta^2C_m$ $+ 8be\beta^2C_m - 8bh\beta^3C_m + 24ab\beta\gamma C_m - 8be\beta\gamma C_m + 16bh\beta^2\gamma C_m$ $- 8ab\gamma^2C_m - 8bh\beta\gamma^2C_m - 4b\beta^3C_2C_m + 8b\beta^2\gamma C_2C_m - 4b\beta\gamma^2C_2C_m$ $+ 8b^2\beta^2C_m^2 + 4b\beta^3C_m^2 - 12b^2\beta\gamma C_m^2 - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_m^2 + 4b^2\gamma^2C_m^2$ $+ 4b\beta\gamma^2C_m^2 - 8be\beta^2C_r + 8bh\beta^3C_r + 8be\beta\gamma C_r - 16bh\beta^2\gamma C_r$ $+ 8bh\beta\gamma^2C_r + 4b\beta^3C_2C_r - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_2C_r + 4b\beta\gamma^2C_2C_r - 8b\beta^3C_mC_r$ $+ 16b\beta^2\gamma C_mC_r - 8b\beta\gamma^2C_mC_r + 4b\beta^3C_r^2 - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_r^2 + 4b\beta\gamma^2C_r^2$ $+ 2b\beta(\beta - \gamma)C_1((\beta - \gamma)C_2 - 2(e - h\beta + h\gamma + (\beta - \gamma)C_m + (-\beta + \gamma)C_r)) - 4b\beta(\beta - \gamma)C_0((\beta - \gamma)C_1 + (\beta - \gamma)C_2 - 2(e - h\beta + h\gamma + (\beta - \gamma)C_m + (-\beta + \gamma)C_r))$ |
| $\pi_r^* = \frac{1}{32(2\beta^2 - 3\beta\gamma + \gamma^2)} (4\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_0^2$ $+ \beta((-\beta + \gamma)C_1 + (-\beta + \gamma)C_2 + 2(e - h\beta + h\gamma + (\beta - \gamma)C_m + (-\beta + \gamma)C_r))^2 + 4(\beta - \gamma)C_0(\beta(-\beta + \gamma)C_1 + \beta(-\beta + \gamma)C_2$ $+ 2(e\beta - h\beta^2 + h\beta\gamma - 4a\beta\theta + 2a\gamma\theta + (\beta^2 - \beta\gamma + 4b\beta\theta - 2b\gamma\theta)C_m + \beta(-\beta + \gamma)C_r))$ |
| $\pi_1^* = \frac{1}{64(-4\beta^2 + \gamma^2)^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2 - 2(-2\beta^2 + \beta\gamma$ $+ \gamma^2)C_0 - (10\beta^2 + 3\beta\gamma - 5\gamma^2)C_1 + 6\beta^2C_2 + 5\beta\gamma C_2 - 3\gamma^2C_2$ $+ 4\beta^2C_m - 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r + 2\gamma^2C_r)^2$ |
| $\pi_2^* = \frac{1}{64(-4\beta^2 + \gamma^2)^2} \beta(-4e\beta + 4h\beta^2 - 2e\gamma - 2h\beta\gamma - 2h\gamma^2 + 2(-2\beta^2 + \beta\gamma$ $+ \gamma^2)C_0 + (-6\beta^2 - 5\beta\gamma + 3\gamma^2)C_1 + 10\beta^2C_2 + 3\beta\gamma C_2 - 5\gamma^2C_2$ $- 4\beta^2C_m + 2\beta\gamma C_m + 2\gamma^2C_m + 4\beta^2C_r - 2\beta\gamma C_r - 2\gamma^2C_r)^2$ |

Table 2. The profits of each member of the supply chain with subsidies

| |
|--|
| $T_1^{s*} = \frac{1}{32\beta^2 - 8\gamma^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 + 10S\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma + 3S\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2 - 5S\gamma^2$ $+ (4\beta^2 - 2\beta\gamma - 2\gamma^2)C_0 + (-10\beta^2 - 3\beta\gamma + 5\gamma^2)C_1 + 6\beta^2C_2$ $+ 5\beta\gamma C_2 - 3\gamma^2C_2 + 4\beta^2C_m - 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r$ $+ 2\gamma^2C_r)$ |
| $T_2^{s*} = \frac{1}{32\beta^2 - 8\gamma^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 - 6S\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma - 5S\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2 + 3S\gamma^2$ $+ (4\beta^2 - 2\beta\gamma - 2\gamma^2)C_0 + (6\beta^2 + 5\beta\gamma - 3\gamma^2)C_1 - 10\beta^2C_2 - 3\beta\gamma C_2$ $+ 5\gamma^2C_2 + 4\beta^2C_m - 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r + 2\gamma^2C_r)$ |
| $\pi_m^{s*} = \frac{1}{16b(\beta - \gamma)(2\beta - \gamma)} (4be^2\beta + 8a^2\beta^2 - 8beh\beta^2 + 4beS\beta^2 + 4bh^2\beta^3$ $- 4bhS\beta^3 + bS^2\beta^3 - 12a^2\beta\gamma + 8beh\beta\gamma - 4beS\beta\gamma - 8bh^2\beta^2\gamma$ $+ 8bhS\beta^2\gamma - 2bS^2\beta^2\gamma + 4a^2\gamma^2 + 4bh^2\beta\gamma^2 - 4bhS\beta\gamma^2 + bS^2\beta\gamma^2$ $+ 4b\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_0^2 + b\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_1^2 - 4be\beta^2C_2 + 4bh\beta^3C_2$ $- 2bS\beta^3C_2 + 4be\beta\gamma C_2 - 8bh\beta^2\gamma C_2 + 4bS\beta^2\gamma C_2 + 4bh\beta\gamma^2C_2$ $- 2bS\beta\gamma^2C_2 + b\beta^3C_2^2 - 2b\beta^2\gamma C_2^2 + b\beta\gamma^2C_2^2 - 16ab\beta^2C_m$ $+ 8be\beta^2C_m - 8bh\beta^3C_m + 4bS\beta^3C_m + 24ab\beta\gamma C_m - 8be\beta\gamma C_m$ $+ 16bh\beta^2\gamma C_m - 8bS\beta^2\gamma C_m - 8ab\gamma^2C_m - 8bh\beta\gamma^2C_m + 4bS\beta\gamma^2C_m$ $- 4b\beta^3C_2C_m + 8b\beta^2\gamma C_2C_m - 4b\beta\gamma^2C_2C_m + 8b^2\beta^2C_m^2 + 4b\beta^3C_m^2$ $- 12b^2\beta\gamma C_m^2 - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_m^2 + 4b^2\gamma^2C_m^2 + 4b\beta\gamma^2C_m^2 - 8be\beta^2C_r$ $+ 8bh\beta^3C_r - 4bS\beta^3C_r + 8be\beta\gamma C_r - 16bh\beta^2\gamma C_r + 8bS\beta^2\gamma C_r$ $+ 8bh\beta\gamma^2C_r - 4bS\beta\gamma^2C_r + 4b\beta^3C_2C_r - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_2C_r + 4b\beta\gamma^2C_2C_r$ $- 8b\beta^3C_mC_r + 16b\beta^2\gamma C_mC_r - 8b\beta\gamma^2C_mC_r + 4b\beta^3C_r^2 - 8b\beta^2\gamma C_r^2$ $+ 4b\beta\gamma^2C_r^2 + 2b\beta(\beta - \gamma)C_1(-2e + 2h\beta - S\beta - 2h\gamma + S\gamma + (\beta$ $- \gamma)C_2 - 2(\beta - \gamma)C_m + 2\beta C_r - 2\gamma C_r) - 4b\beta(\beta - \gamma)C_0(-2e$ $+ 2h\beta - S\beta - 2h\gamma + S\gamma + (\beta - \gamma)C_1 + (\beta - \gamma)C_2 - 2\beta C_m + 2\gamma C_m$ $+ 2\beta C_r - 2\gamma C_r))$ |
| $\pi_r^{s*} = \frac{1}{32(2\beta^2 - 3\beta\gamma + \gamma^2)} (4\beta(\beta - \gamma)^2C_0^2$ $+ \beta(2e - 2h\beta + S\beta + 2h\gamma - S\gamma + (-\beta + \gamma)C_1 + (-\beta + \gamma)C_2$ $+ 2\beta C_m - 2\gamma C_m - 2\beta C_r + 2\gamma C_r)^2 + 4(\beta - \gamma)C_0(2e\beta - 2h\beta^2 + S\beta^2$ $+ 2h\beta\gamma - S\beta\gamma - 8a\beta\theta + 4a\gamma\theta + \beta(-\beta + \gamma)C_1 + \beta(-\beta + \gamma)C_2$ $+ 2\beta^2C_m - 2\beta\gamma C_m + 8b\beta\theta C_m - 4b\gamma\theta C_m - 2\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r))$ |
| $\pi_1^{s*} = \frac{1}{64(-4\beta^2 + \gamma^2)^2} \beta(4e\beta - 4h\beta^2 + 10S\beta^2 + 2e\gamma + 2h\beta\gamma + 3S\beta\gamma + 2h\gamma^2$ $- 5S\gamma^2 - 2(-2\beta^2 + \beta\gamma + \gamma^2)C_0 - (10\beta^2 + 3\beta\gamma - 5\gamma^2)C_1 + 6\beta^2C_2$ $+ 5\beta\gamma C_2 - 3\gamma^2C_2 + 4\beta^2C_m - 2\beta\gamma C_m - 2\gamma^2C_m - 4\beta^2C_r + 2\beta\gamma C_r$ $+ 2\gamma^2C_r)^2$ |
| $\pi_2^{s*} = \frac{1}{64(-4\beta^2 + \gamma^2)^2} \beta(-4e\beta + 4h\beta^2 + 6S\beta^2 - 2e\gamma - 2h\beta\gamma + 5S\beta\gamma - 2h\gamma^2$ $- 3S\gamma^2 + 2(-2\beta^2 + \beta\gamma + \gamma^2)C_0 + (-6\beta^2 - 5\beta\gamma + 3\gamma^2)C_1$ $+ 10\beta^2C_2 + 3\beta\gamma C_2 - 5\gamma^2C_2 - 4\beta^2C_m + 2\beta\gamma C_m + 2\gamma^2C_m + 4\beta^2C_r$ $- 2\beta\gamma C_r - 2\gamma^2C_r)^2$ |